Measuring Elevation Change in Berry's Creek Marshes Using Surface Elevation Tables (SETs) and Marker Horizons Meadowlands Environmental Research Institute (Spring 2015)

The SET (Sediment Elevation Table) provides a constant plane in space from which the distance to the sediment surface can be measured by means of pins lowered to the marsh surface (USGS 2010). Benchmark rods were established, marker horizons of feldspar were emplaced and baseline readings were taken at two locations in the Berry's Creek watershed during the spring of 2009. Each site was revisited and readings were taken in the spring of 2015. This report is a summary of those measurements.

Walden Swamp

Eight Day Swamp

Figure 1: Study Area

At each site, three replicate plots have been installed. At each plot, nine pins are lowered to the marsh surface. Readings are taken in each of four orientations resulting in a total of 108 measurements. At the time of each subsequent reading, results obtained from each pin are compared. The average of the resulting differences becomes one data point that represents the level of the marsh surface. To obtain a yearly rate, this value is be divided by the number of days that have elapsed between establishment of

the benchmark and the subsequent reading. Approximately six years elapsed between the readings summarized in this report (Table 1).

Table 1: Time Elapsed Between Readings

| Location | Initial Date | Subsequent Date | Days | Years |
|-------------|--------------|-----------------|------|-------|
| EDS-1, 2, 3 | 4/30/2009 | 4/27/2015 | 2188 | 5.99 |
| WS-1, 2, 3 | 4/30/2009 | 5/7/2015 | 2198 | 6.02 |

Table 1 provides the dates for each reading and the time elapsed in days and years.

Table 2: Average Elevation Change (mm) – Spring 2015 Sampling

| Eight Day Swamp | | | | | | | | | | |
|-----------------|-------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| All Platforms | 53.90 | | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 3.09 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 | 53.0 | | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 14.89 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 | 49.06 | | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 7.05 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 | 59.6 | | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 6.3 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 pos 2 | 80.9 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 pos 4 | 71.3 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 pos 6 | 14.4 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 pos 8 | 45.33 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 pos 2 | 46.44 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 pos 4 | 41.1 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 pos 6 | 69.67 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 pos 8 | 39.00 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 pos 1 | 49.7 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 pos 3 | 77.6 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 pos 5 | 59.4 | | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 pos 7 | 51.89 | | | | | | | | | |

| Walden Swa | amp |
|---------------|--------|
| All Platforms | 77.86 |
| Std Error | 8.81 |
| WS-1 | 77.8 |
| Std Error | 8.37 |
| WS-2 | 93.17 |
| Std Error | 15.91 |
| WS-3 | 62.6 |
| Std Error | 6.6 |
| WS-1 pos 2 | 85.1 |
| WS-1 pos 4 | 95.2 |
| WS-1 pos 6 | 56.0 |
| WS-1 pos 8 | 74.78 |
| WS-2 pos 2 | 126.67 |
| WS-2 pos 4 | 57.4 |
| WS-2 pos 6 | 76.44 |
| WS-2 pos 8 | 112.11 |
| WS-3 pos 2 | 50.2 |
| WS-3 pos 4 | 52.2 |
| WS-3 pos 6 | 74.6 |
| WS-3 pos 8 | 73.56 |

Table 2a: SETs Measurements – Spring 2015 sampling

| Site | Marsh Type | Dominant Vegetation | Rate of Elevation Change (mm/yr) |
|-----------------|------------|------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Eight Day Swamp | High | Phragmites | 8.99 |
| Walden Swamp | High | Phragmites | 12.93 |

Tables 2 and 2a are summaries of the changes in elevation measured at each location.

Table 2 contains the averages of elevation changes obtained at each of the three plots (EDS-1, EDS-2, EDS-3 for Eight Day Swamp and WS-1, WS-2, WS-3 for Walden Swamp) as well as at each of

the 4 orientation positions. The averages of measurements from all 108 platforms at each site are also included in Table 2. The average of all the platforms is then divided by the time elapsed since the initial date (Table 1) to derive the rate of elevation change in mm/yr (Table 2a). For the complete data set, please refer to Appendices at the end of this report.

Table 3: Average Accretion (mm) – Spring 2015 sampling

| Eight Day Swamp | | | | | | | | | |
|-----------------|-------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| All Platforms | 43.33 | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 2.55 | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 | 41.67 | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 7.50 | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 | 48.33 | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 1.67 | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 | 40.00 | | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 2.50 | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-1 | | | | | | | | | |
| Plot A | 40.0 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot B | 35.0 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot C | 50.0 | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-2 | | | | | | | | | |
| Plot A | 45.0 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot B | 50.0 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot C | 50.0 | | | | | | | | |
| EDS-3 | | | | | | | | | |
| Plot A | 35.0 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot B | 40.0 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot C | 45.0 | | | | | | | | |

| Walden Swamp | | | | | | | | |
|---------------|-------|--|--|--|--|--|--|--|
| All Platforms | 49.11 | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 5.60 | | | | | | | |
| WS-1 | 50.00 | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 12.50 | | | | | | | |
| WS-2 | 39.00 | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 5.86 | | | | | | | |
| WS-3 | 58.33 | | | | | | | |
| Std Error | 12.50 | | | | | | | |
| WS-1 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot A | 45.0 | | | | | | | |
| Plot B | 65.0 | | | | | | | |
| Plot C | 40.0 | | | | | | | |
| WS-2 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot A | 30.0 | | | | | | | |
| Plot B | 37.0 | | | | | | | |
| Plot C | 50.0 | | | | | | | |
| WS-3 | | | | | | | | |
| Plot A | 75.0 | | | | | | | |
| Plot B | 50.0 | | | | | | | |
| Plot C | 50.0 | | | | | | | |

Table 3a: Feldspar Horizon Measurements - Spring 2015 sampling

| Site | Positive Accretion (Percent) | Accretion Rate (mm/yr) |
|-----------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------|
| Eight Day Swamp | 100 | 7.23 |
| Walden Swamp | 100 | 8.16 |

Tables 3 and 3a are summaries of the accretion measured by use of feldspar horizons emplaced at each benchmark location

Feldspar horizons were emplaced inside three corners of each benchmark plot. The sediment between the white feldspar marker and the horizon is measured. One reading is taken at each of the three

corners resulting in a total of nine values associated with each marsh; the average of all readings produces a summary value (Table 3a). Not all horizons produced recognizable accretion; it is possible that the feldspar cannot be found and will need to be replaced and a new data set generated. Where negligible material accumulated above the horizon, "NA accretion" is designated. All recoverable values are included in the calculation for accretion rate.

To obtain a yearly rate, this value is divided by the number of days that have elapsed between establishment of the benchmark and the subsequent reading. Approximately six years elapsed between the readings summarized in this report. Table 1 provides the dates for each reading and the time elapsed in days and years.

Table 4: Elevation Rate and Accretion Rate – Spring 2009 to Spring 2015

| Eight Day Swamp | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------------------|-----------|-----------|----------|------------|-----------|-----------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Days 0 378 736 1322 1819 2188 | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Sample Date | 4/30/2009 | 5/13/2010 | 5/6/2011 | 12/12/2012 | 4/23/2014 | 4/27/2015 | | | | | |
| Elevation Rate mm/yr | 0 | 19.07 | 18.67 | 14.40 | 11.64 | 8.99 | | | | | |
| Accretion Rate mm/yr | 0 | 5.92 | 5.68 | 5.74 | 6.05 | 7.23 | | | | | |

| Walden Swamp | | | | | | | | | | | |
|-------------------------------------|-----------------|-----------|--------------------|------|-----------|----------|--|--|--|--|--|
| Days 0 378 736 1310 1824 219 | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Sample Date | 4/30/2009 | 5/13/2010 | 5/13/2010 5/6/2011 | | 4/28/2014 | 5/7/2015 | | | | | |
| Elevation Rate mm/yr | on Rate mm/yr 0 | | 40.27 32.82 | | 18.37 | 12.93 | | | | | |
| Accretion Rate mm/yr | 0 | 3.77 | 8.40 | 9.38 | 7.92 | 8.16 | | | | | |

Table 4 shows the yearly accretion and elevation rate for every sampling event.

Table 5: Marsh Processes (USGS 2010)

Table 5 explains both surface and subsurface interactions (USGS, 2010).

Discussion

While it is tempting to draw conclusions from this data set, one must acknowledge that marsh sediment processes take place slowly over long periods of time; to quote Jim Lynch, USGS SETs methodology expert, "...It will take a long time to get enough data to see what's going on." (2010, personal communication)

Table 5 shows both surface and subsurface processes that can affect both the elevation and accretion rates. Elevation is affected by the surface and subsurface processes while the accretion is only affected by the surface processes.

According to table 4, the elevation rates for both Eight Day Swamp and Walden Swamp are decreasing each year while the accretion rates remain constant. Eight Day Swamp has an average accretion rate of 6 mm/yr and Walden Swamp has an average of 8 mm/yr.

Conclusion

In the years to come, the rates of accretion and elevation change will continue to drop as seen in table 4 and then stabilize. These two sites are well over the initial readings taken in 2009, but it is still too early to form any real conclusions from the present data.

References

- Cahoon, D., Reed, D., Day, J Jr. 1995. Estimating shallow subsidence in microtidal salt marshes of the southeastern United States: Kaye and Barghoorn revisited. Marine Geology 128, 1-9.
- Lynch, J. 2010. USGS Patuxent Wildlife Research Center, Personal Communication.
- USGS 2010. SET Concepts and Theory, url: http://www.pwrc.usgs.gov/set/theory.html#mh
 Patuxent Wildlife Research Center.
- Weis, P., Barrett, K, Proctor, T., and Bopp, R. 2005. Studies of a contaminated brackish marsh in the Hackensack Meadowlands of northeastern New Jersey: An assessment of natural recovery. Marine Pollution Bulletin 50, 1405–1415

Appendix 1: Eight Day Swamp Surface Elevation Table Readings (mm)

| Plot | | EDS-1 | | | Plot | | EDS-2 | | | Plot | | EDS-3 | | |
|----------|--------|------------|------------|------------|----------|--------|-----------|-----------|------------|----------|--------|----------|------------|------------|
| Position | Pin | 4/30/2009 | 4/27/2015 | Difference | Position | Pin | 4/30/2009 | 4/27/2015 | Difference | Position | Pin | 5/1/2009 | 4/27/2015 | Difference |
| 2 | 1 | 91 | 178 | 87 | 2 | 1 | 56 | 106 | 50 | 2 | 1 | 64 | 154 | 90 |
| | 2 | 45 | 168 | 123 | | 2 | 68 | 104 | 36 | | 2 | 64 | 138 | 74 |
| | 3 | 42 | 132 | 90 | | 3 | 71 | 96 | 25 | | 3 | 111 | 138 | 27 |
| | 4 | 40 | 131 | 91 | | 4 | 67 | 129 | 62 | | 4 | 102 | 149 | 47 |
| | 5 | 83 | 137 | 54 | | 5 | 85 | 94 | 9 | | 5 | 107 | 136 | 29 |
| | 6 | 65 | 135 | 70 | | 6 | 65 | 126 | 61 | | 6 | 113 | 157 | 44 |
| | 7 | 70 | 128 | 58 | | 7 | 61 | 96 | 35 | | 7 | 103 | 135 | 32 |
| | 8 | 65 | 134 | 69 | | 8 | 70 | 136 | 66 | | 8 | 101 | 145 | 44 |
| | 9 | 50 | 136 | 86 | | 9 | 53 | 127 | 74 | | 9 | 81 | 141 | 60 |
| 4 | 1 | 21 | 129 | 108 | 4 | 1 | 43 | 125 | 82 | 4 | 1 | 54 | 165 | 111 |
| | 2 | 21 | 112 | 91 | | 2 | 65 | 110 | 45 | | 2 | 90 | 157 | 67 |
| | 3 | 38 | 114 | 76 | | 3 | 67 | 110 | 43 | | 3 | 80 | 157 | 77 |
| | 4 | 50 | 102 | 52 | | 4 | 65 | 112 | 47 | | 4 | 56 | 145 | 89 |
| | 5 | 58 | 115 | 57 | | 5 | 60 | 98 | 38 | | 5 | 80 | 164 | 84 |
| | 6 | 48 | 114 | 66 | | 6 | 75 | 100 | 25 | | 6 | 75 | 153 | 78 |
| | 7 | 13 | 110 | 97 | | 7 | 75 | 102 | 27 | | 7 | 86 | 161 | 75 |
| | 8 | 60 | 111 | 51 | | 8 | 68 | 101 | 33 | | 8 | 76 | 144 | 68 |
| | 9 | 60 | 104 | 44 | | 9 | 64 | 94 | 30 | | 9 | 80 | 129 | 49 |
| 6 | 1 | 60 | 109 | 49 | 6 | 1 | 30 | 88 | 58 | 6 | 1 | 82 | 150 | |
| | 2 | 118 134 | 124 118 | 6 | | 2 | 24 20 | 86 116 | 62 96 | | 3 | 79 87 | 149 | 70 56 |
| | | | | -16 | | 3 | | - | | | | | 143 | 45 |
| | 4 5 | 105 123 | 113 110 | -13 | | 4 5 | 37 48 | 117 | 80 50 | | 4 5 | 89 89 | 134 164 | 45 75 |
| | 6 | 123 | 105 | -13 | | 6 | 48 | 98 96 | 50 54 | | 6 | 95 | 145 | 75 50 |
| | 7 | 52 | 116 | 64 | | 7 | 49 | 127 | 78 | | 7 | 97 | 135 | 38 |
| | 8 | 55 | 118 | 63 | | 8 | 46 | 112 | 66 | | 8 | 92 | 154 | 62 |
| | 9 | 112 | 99 | -13 | | 9 | 62 | 145 | 83 | | 9 | 60 | 131 | 71 |
| 8 | 1 | 55 | 87 | 32 | 8 | 1 | 74 | 110 | 36 | 8 | 1 | 100 | 149 | 49 |
| | 2 | 60 | 101 | 41 | | 2 | 62 | 104 | 42 | | 2 | 98 | 139 | 41 |
| | 3 | 65 | 99 | 34 | | 3 | 64 | 94 | 30 | | 3 | 93 | 139 | 46 |
| | 4 | 64 | 95 | 31 | | 4 | 51 | 111 | 60 | | 4 | 78 | 146 | 68 |
| | 5 | 66 | 110 | 44 | | 5 | 74 | 101 | 27 | | 5 | 80 | 146 | 66 |
| | 6 | 62 | 130 | 68 | | 6 | 76 | 99 | 23 | | 6 | 80 | 127 | 47 |
| | 7 | 60 | 109 | 49 | | 7 | 63 | 108 | 45 | | 7 | 97 | 135 | 38 |
| | 8 | 58 | 120 | 62 | | 8 | 62 | 95 | 33 | | 8 | 80 | 137 | 57 |
| | 9 | 63 | 110 | 47 | | 9 | 50 | 105 | 55 | | 9 | 77 | 132 | 55 |

Appendix 2: Walden Swamp Surface Elevation Table Readings (mm)

| Plot | | WS-1 | | | Plot | | WS-2 | | | Plot | | WS-3 | | 35 mm | |
|----------|-----|-----------|----------|------------|----------|-----|-----------|----------|------------|----------|-----|-----------|----------|--------|------------|
| Position | Pin | 4/30/2009 | 5/7/2015 | Difference | Position | Pin | 4/30/2009 | 5/7/2015 | Difference | Position | Pin | 4/30/2009 | 5/7/2015 | offset | Difference |
| 2 | 1 | 42 | 147 | 105 | 2 | 1 | 179 | 298 | 119 | 1 | 1 | 110 | 135 | 170 | 60 |
| | 2 | 53 | 156 | 103 | | 2 | 156 | 254 | 98 | | 2 | 96 | 140 | 175 | 79 |
| | 3 | 61 | 161 | 100 | | 3 | 150 | 263 | 113 | | 3 | 112 | 110 | 145 | |
| | 4 | 121 | 125 | 4 | | 4 | 69 | 249 | 180 | | 4 | 109 | 111 | 146 | 37 |
| | 5 | 25 | 153 | 128 | | 5 | 223 | 291 | 68 | | 5 | 94 | 100 | 135 | 41 |
| | 6 | 45 | 134 | 89 | | 6 | 155 | 280 | 125 | | 6 | 112 | 121 | 156 | |
| | 7 | 50 | 137 | 87 | | 7 | 123 | 234 | 111 | | 7 | 90 | 110 | 145 | |
| | 8 | 40 | 149 | 109 | | 8 | 83 | 265 | 182 | | 8 | 112 | 132 | 167 | 55 |
| | 9 | 100 | 141 | 41 | | 9 | 117 | 261 | 144 | | 9 | 97 | 110 | 145 | |
| 4 | 1 | 51 | 155 | 104 | 4 | 1 | 176 | 227 | 51 | 3 | 1 | 112 | 135 | 170 | |
| | 2 | 71 | 161 | 90 | | 2 | 156 | 187 | 31 | | 2 | 118 | 140 | 175 | |
| | 3 | 87 | 134 | 47 | | 3 | 172 | 237 | 65 | | 3 | 115 | 110 | 145 | |
| | 4 | 52 | 139 | 87 | | 4 | 82 | 217 | 135 | | 4 | 127 | 111 | 146 | |
| | 5 | 63 | 122 | 59 | | 5 | 192 | 198 | 6 | | 5 | 101 | 100 | 135 | |
| | 6 | 67 | 162 | 95 | | 6 | 127 | 188 | 61 | | 6 | 88 | 121 | 156 | |
| | 7 | 41 | 164 | 123 | | 7 | 175 | 213 | 38 | | 7 | 98 | 110 | 145 | |
| | 8 | 33 | 146 | 113 | | 8 | 144 | 209 | 65 | | 8 | 75 | 132 | 167 | |
| | 9 | 12 | 151 | 139 | | 9 | 157 | 222 | 65 | | 9 | 80 | 110 | 145 | |
| 6 | 1 | 43 | 140 | 97 | 6 | 1 | 230 | 215 | -15 | | 1 | 106 | 148 | 183 | |
| | 2 | 80 | 130 | 50 | | 2 | 200 | 276 | 76 | | 2 | 106 | 153 | 188 | l |
| | 3 | 87 | 131 | 44 | | 3 | 155 | 264 | 109 | | 3 | 98 | 154 | 189 | - |
| | 4 | 78 | 160 | 82 | | 4 | 195 | 240 | 45 | | 4 | 96 | 124 | 159 | |
| | 5 | 95 | 134 | 39 | | 5 | 115 | 272 | 157 | | 5 | 96 | 123 | 158 | |
| | 6 | 92 | 135 | 43 | | 6 | 140 | 250 | 110 | | 6 | 85 | 140 | 175 | |
| | 7 | 80 | 124 | 44 | | 7 | 118 | 210 | 92 | | 7 | 96 | 102 | 137 | |
| | 8 | 90 | 130 | 40 | | 8 | 170 | 215 | 45 | | 8 | 65 | 107 | 142 | |
| _ | 9 | 70 | 135 | 65 | | 9 | 150 | 219 | 69 | | 9 | 71 | 124 | 159 | |
| 8 | 1 | 73 | 137 | 64 | 8 | 1 | 172 | 244 | 72 | 7 | 1 | 68 | 130 | 165 | |
| | 2 | 73 | 130 | 57 | | 2 | 230 | 271 | 41 | | 2 | 69 | 125 | 160 | |
| | 3 | 81 | 140 | 59 | | 3 | 170 | 268 | 98 | | 3 | 78 | 130 | 165 | |
| | 4 | 70 | 140 | 70 | | 4 | 94 | 260 | 166 | | 4 | 116 | 126 | 161 | 45 |
| | 5 | 80 | 132 | 52 | | 5 | 120 | 241 | 121 | | 5 | 52 | 122 | 157 | |
| | 6 | 45 | 154 | 109 | | 6 | 110 | 244 | 134 | | 6 | 93 | 128 | 163 | |
| | 7 | 50 | 152 | 102 | | 7 | 136 | 254 | 118 | | 7 | 164 | 116 | 151 | -13 |
| | 8 | 80 | 146 | 66 | | 8 | 100 | 285 | 185 | | 8 | 75 | 128 | 163 | |
| | 9 | 55 | 149 | 94 | | 9 | 195 | 269 | 74 | | 9 | 95 | 152 | 187 | 92 |

^{*}The 35 mm offset means it is 35 mm higher than the SET benchmark rods installation elevation and it is used in calculating the difference.